



March 2012

FAFEN Health Institution Monitor

A report based on monitoring of
65 District Headquarter Hospitals
across the country

Vol: 4, Issue: 099/April 2012

Specialised services lacking at DHQs; effective oversight required

Specialised services were found lacking at the District Headquarter Hospitals (DHQs) monitored in February 2012. Of the 65 such facilities monitored, three-fourths did not offer psychiatry while 61% were without physiotherapy services.

Similarly, about two-fifths of the hospitals had no services for cardiology (40%) and chest specialists (43%) while 44% were without orthopedics. Also, 24 DHQs did not have ENT specialists.

Since patients are referred to DHQs for specialised treatment, lack of these services mean they have to seek treatment privately. In January this year, 2,622 serious patients were referred to the monitored DHQs. Through effective oversight, the government should ensure availability of the promised services at its health facilities.

However, more than 80% of the observed DHQs had specialised dental, surgery, pediatric, pathology, ophthalmology, gynecology and obstetric services available.

Eleven health facilities did not have blood banks; seven were without ophthalmology rooms and three lacked labour rooms. There were no Sui gas connections available in 30 DHQs while eight did not have arrangements for clean drinking water, had no washrooms with running water and no proper waiting area for patients.

All the monitored DHQs had wards for in-patients and laboratories for tests. Similarly all but one DHQ in Balochistan had emergency wards for out-patients and dental rooms. There were operation rooms for carrying out major operations in 64 of the 65 health facilities monitored. All but two hospitals in Balochistan had generators for power backup.

To gauge patients' perception, 193 of them were interviewed with 45 saying they had to pay for prescribed medicines they got from the in-house pharmacy. This indicates corruption in those health facilities. On the other hand, 148 patients expressed satisfaction with the support and guidance they received from the paramedical staff. However, 22 complained about absence of doctors, 50 thought the time given by the doctors in attending to them was insufficient while 33 categorized doctors' behaviour as rude.

Unavailability of doctors and complaints about insufficient time could be attributed to lower occupancy rates of medical staff and hence the shortage of doctors. The occupancy rate of sanctioned and appointed posts of paramedical, support and administrative staff was comparatively better. Though information on the sanctioned and posted staff in government-run institutions must be shared if requested, health facilities withheld information on certain appointments. A low government oversight was observed. In the three months (November 2011- January 2012) 55 visits were made by government/elected officials to the monitored health facilities. Of these, the highest of 24 were made by the Executive District Officers (EDOs)/health, followed by government officials (16 visits), MPAs (10) and MNAs (5).

Detailed findings

FAFEN governance monitors visited 65 DHQs in February 2012. Of these 27 were monitored in Punjab, 15 in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), 12 in Sindh and 11 in Balochistan.

1. General facilities

The DHQs had electricity connections and fans and were connected by proper roads.

However, three health facilities did not have boundary walls while four hospital buildings were not in good condition.

Medicines were not available at the in-house pharmacy of five DHQs - two each in Punjab and Balochistan and one in KP.

Eight DHQs– five in Balochistan, two in KP and one in Sindh – did not have arrangements for clean drinking water and washrooms with running water for patients. Similarly, two DHQs each in Punjab, Sindh, KP and Balochistan were without a proper place/shade for waiting patients. Health facilities in nine districts were not clean.

Thirty out of 65 DHQs – 11 in KP, 10 in Punjab, six in Balochistan and three in Sindh – did not have Sui gas connections. At least 12 had no residential facility for the staff and 13 did not have such arrangement for doctors.

| S. # | Questions | | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
|------|---|-----|--------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| 1. | A proper road leads to health facility | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2. | Medicines are available in the in-house pharmacy | Yes | 25 | 12 | 14 | 9 | 60 |
| | | No | 2 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| 3. | The building is in a good condition | Yes | 27 | 11 | 14 | 9 | 61 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 4 |
| 4. | The health facility has a landline telephone connection | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 10 | 64 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 5. | The health facility has a Sui Gas connection | Yes | 17 | 9 | 4 | 5 | 35 |
| | | No | 10 | 3 | 11 | 6 | 30 |
| 6. | The health facility has clean drinking water arrangements for patients | Yes | 27 | 11 | 13 | 6 | 57 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 2 | 5 | 8 |
| 7. | The health facility has electricity | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 8. | The health facility has fans in wards | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9. | The health facility has washroom (with running water) for patients | Yes | 27 | 11 | 13 | 6 | 57 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 2 | 5 | 8 |
| 10. | The health facility is clean | Yes | 23 | 11 | 13 | 9 | 56 |
| | | No | 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 9 |
| 11. | There are residential quarters for staff in the premises of health facility | Yes | 24 | 9 | 12 | 8 | 53 |
| | | No | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 12 |
| 12. | There is a boundary wall around the health facility | Yes | 26 | 12 | 14 | 10 | 62 |
| | | No | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 3 |
| 13. | There is a residential house for the doctors in the premises of health facility | Yes | 23 | 8 | 13 | 8 | 52 |
| | | No | 4 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 13 |
| 14. | There is proper place/shade for waiting patients | Yes | 25 | 10 | 13 | 9 | 57 |
| | | No | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 8 |

2. Physical facilities

Though a DHQ is supposed to provide patients with specialised healthcare, three facilities - one each in Punjab, KP and Balochistan - did not have rooms to handle delivery cases. There were also no ophthalmology rooms in four DHQs in Balochistan, two in KP and one in Sindh.

Eleven DHQs – five in Balochistan and three each in KP and Sindh – did not have blood banks. Lack of these facilities can be life threatening for patients. Forty DHQs – 17 of them in Punjab, 11 in KP, nine in Balochistan and three in Sindh – did not have a kitchen for preparing food for patients.

All the monitored DHQs had wards for in-patients and laboratory for tests. Similarly all but one DHQ in Balochistan had emergency wards for out-patients and a dental room. Sixty four of the 65 monitored health facilities had operation rooms for carrying out major operations. A generator for power backup was available in all but two DHQs in Balochistan.

| S. # | Questions | Yes/No | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
|------|---|--------|--------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| 1. | The health facility has wards for in-patients | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 2. | The health facility has emergency wards for out-patients | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 10 | 64 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 3. | The health facility has an X-Ray room | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 4. | The health facility has dental room | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 10 | 64 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 5. | The health facility has labour room | Yes | 26 | 12 | 14 | 10 | 62 |
| | | No | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 3 |
| 6. | The health facility has operation room for major operations | Yes | 27 | 12 | 14 | 11 | 64 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 7. | The health facility has ophthalmology room | Yes | 27 | 11 | 13 | 7 | 58 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 7 |
| 8. | The health facility has laboratory for tests | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9. | The health facility has blood bank | Yes | 27 | 9 | 12 | 6 | 54 |
| | | No | 0 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 11 |
| 10. | The health facility has kitchen for preparing food for patients | Yes | 10 | 9 | 4 | 2 | 25 |
| | | No | 17 | 3 | 11 | 9 | 40 |
| 11. | The health facility has a generator for power backup | Yes | 27 | 12 | 15 | 9 | 63 |
| | | No | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 |

3. Specialised services

More than 80% of the DHQs had specialised dental, surgery, pediatric, pathology, ophthalmology and gynecology and obstetric services.

Dental specialists were there in 57 hospitals, surgery (59), pediatric (59), pathology (55), ophthalmology (57) and gynecology and obstetric (55) out of the 65 DHQs. Fifty DHQs had radiology services but five hospitals in Sindh, four in KP, and three each in Punjab and Balochistan did not have this facility.

Other specialised services were also found missing in at least three-fourths of the DHQs. Only 16 of the 65 hospitals monitored had psychiatry services. Twenty DHQs in Punjab, 10 each in Sindh and KP and nine in Balochistan did not have this facility.

Similarly, 40 DHQs had no physiotherapists– 12 in Punjab, 10 each in Sindh and Balochistan and eight in KP.

About two-fifths of the DHQs did not have cardiology (40%) and chest specialist (43%) services whereas 44% of the DHQs were without orthopedics. Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT) specialists were not available in 24 DHQs – eight in Punjab, six each in Sindh and Balochistan and four in KP.

| S. # | Questions | Yes/No | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
|------|----------------------------------|--------|--------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| 1. | Cardiology (Heart) | Yes | 20 | 7 | 9 | 3 | 39 |
| | | No | 7 | 5 | 6 | 8 | 26 |
| 2. | Chest specialist | Yes | 18 | 9 | 7 | 3 | 37 |
| | | No | 9 | 3 | 8 | 8 | 28 |
| 3. | Dental | Yes | 27 | 10 | 13 | 7 | 57 |
| | | No | 0 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 8 |
| 4. | ENT (Ear, Nose, Throat) | Yes | 19 | 6 | 11 | 5 | 41 |
| | | No | 8 | 6 | 4 | 6 | 24 |
| 5. | Gynecology and obstetrics | Yes | 26 | 10 | 12 | 7 | 55 |
| | | No | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 10 |
| 6. | Ophthalmology (eye) | Yes | 27 | 11 | 13 | 6 | 57 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 2 | 5 | 8 |
| 7. | Orthopedic (bone) | Yes | 20 | 7 | 9 | 0 | 36 |
| | | No | 7 | 5 | 6 | 11 | 29 |
| 8. | Pathology (diagnosis of disease) | Yes | 26 | 10 | 12 | 7 | 55 |
| | | No | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 10 |
| 9. | Pediatrics (children) | Yes | 26 | 12 | 13 | 8 | 59 |
| | | No | 1 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 6 |
| 10. | Physiotherapy | Yes | 15 | 2 | 7 | 1 | 25 |
| | | No | 12 | 10 | 8 | 10 | 40 |
| 11. | Psychiatry | Yes | 7 | 2 | 5 | 2 | 16 |
| | | No | 20 | 10 | 10 | 9 | 49 |
| 12. | Radiology (X-Ray) | Yes | 24 | 7 | 11 | 8 | 50 |
| | | No | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 15 |
| 13. | Surgery | Yes | 27 | 11 | 15 | 6 | 59 |
| | | No | 0 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 6 |

4. Patient's perception

Three out-patients per DHQ were interviewed to assess the level of their satisfaction with the services and facilities provided to them.. Out of 193 patients interviewed, 22 complained about the absence of doctors. Of the patients who met the doctor, 50 complained they were not given sufficient time while 33 categorized doctors' behaviour as rude.

On the other hand, 148 patients expressed satisfaction over the support and guidance they received from the staff. However, patients not satisfied with the staff's behaviour included 21 in Punjab, 11 in Balochistan, eight in Sindh and five in KP. Seven patients - six in Punjab and one in Sindh – complained the staff demanded money for providing services.

Forty five patients - 19 in Punjab, 11 in KP, nine in Balochistan and six in Sindh - said they had to pay money for prescribed medicines they got from the in-house pharmacies.

| S. # | Questions | Punjab | | Sindh | | KP | | Balochistan | | Total | |
|------|---|--------|----|-------|----|-----|----|-------------|----|-------|-----|
| | | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | Yes | No |
| 1. | Was doctor present on his/her duty at the DHQ? | 74 | 7 | 31 | 3 | 44 | 1 | 22 | 11 | 171 | 22 |
| 2. | Do you think doctor has given you enough time? | 61 | 20 | 27 | 7 | 38 | 7 | 17 | 16 | 143 | 50 |
| 3. | Was the behaviour of the doctor with you at the DHQ good? | 67 | 14 | 31 | 3 | 37 | 8 | 25 | 8 | 160 | 33 |
| 4. | Did staff at the DHQ provide you all the required support and guidance? | 60 | 21 | 26 | 8 | 40 | 5 | 22 | 11 | 148 | 45 |
| 5. | Did you get free medicines from the in-house pharmacy as per doctor's prescription? | 62 | 19 | 28 | 6 | 34 | 11 | 24 | 9 | 148 | 45 |
| 6. | Did anyone at the DHQ demand illegal money for providing services? | 6 | 75 | 1 | 33 | 0 | 45 | 0 | 33 | 7 | 186 |

5. Referrals

When medical cases cannot be treated at Basic Health Units (BHUs), Rural Health Units (RHUs) and Tehsil Headquarter Hospitals (THQs), they are referred to the DHQs.

In January this year, 2,622 serious patients were referred to 49 DHQs. Of these, 1,861 were referred to 24 DHQs in Punjab, 10 in KP, eight in Balochistan and seven in Sindh.

As many as 2,200 medico legal cases – 1,635 in Punjab, 295 in KP, 199 in Sindh and 71 in Balochistan – were treated at the 48 DHQs in the last calendar month.

| S. # | Region | Number of serious patients referred to DHQ in last calendar month | Number of health facilities sharing information | Number of medico legal cases treated in last calendar month | Number of health facilities sharing information |
|--------------|-------------|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | Punjab | 1861 | 24 | 1635 | 23 |
| 2 | KP | 393 | 10 | 295 | 12 |
| 3 | Balochistan | 111 | 8 | 71 | 7 |
| 4 | Sindh | 257 | 7 | 199 | 6 |
| Total | | 2622 | 49 | 2200 | 48 |

6. Appointments of medical, paramedical, administrative and support staff

FAFEN monitors visited 65 DHQs in February 2012 and sought information on appointments made against sanctioned posts for medical, paramedical, administrative and support staff from the respective administrations.

6.1 Appointment of medical staff

Less than 50% of the monitored DHQs provided information on the posts of female chief medical officer, psychiatrists, female chief medical officers, dermatologists and urologists. The situation related to other positions was comparatively better.

More than three-fourths of the sanctioned positions of female Chief Medical Officers (CMO), surgeons, pediatricians and ophthalmologists were filled.

The occupancy rate was lesser regarding other medical staff. Of the sanctioned posts of medical officers, 71% for male medical officers were occupied. Similarly, for women medical officers the proportion was 62%, male chief medical officers (66%), senior medical officers (63%) and senior women officers (33%).

Among medical specialists, the occupancy rate for positions of radiologists was 43%, which was the lowest. No posts for radiologists were sanctioned in DHQs in Balochistan. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, the occupancy rate was only 27% while in Sindh it was 33% and in Punjab it stood at 51%.

Only half of the sanctioned positions for dermatologists and psychiatrists were filled. Fifty two percent of the sanctioned posts for urologists were occupied as were those of anesthetists (63%), ENT specialists (64%), cardiologists and orthopedic surgeons (68% each), physicians (71%) and chest specialists and gynecologists (7% each).

The occupancy rate of the medical staff in Balochistan DHQs was better than the regions elsewhere. However, in KP, it was the worst.

Since patients visit DHQs for regular and specialised treatment, the occupancy of the sanctioned positions needs to be ensured so that issues like the unavailability of doctors can be resolved.

| Name of post | Sanction strength | | | | | Posted | | | | | Occupancy rate | | | | | Number of DHQs sharing information | | | | |
|--------------------------------|-------------------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|----------------|--------|---------|-------------|--------|------------------------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
| Medical Officer | 685 | 127 | 279 | 111 | 1202 | 484 | 104 | 189 | 72 | 849 | 70.66% | 81.89% | 67.74% | 64.86% | 70.63% | 27 | 11 | 15 | 11 | 64 |
| Women Medical Officer | 176 | 78 | 35 | 51 | 340 | 137 | 35 | 29 | 33 | 234 | 77.84% | 44.87% | 82.86% | 64.71% | 68.82% | 25 | 10 | 12 | 9 | 56 |
| Chief Medical Officer (Female) | 12 | 9 | 2 | 14 | 37 | 8 | 6 | 2 | 12 | 28 | 66.67% | 66.67% | 100.00% | 85.71% | 75.68% | 5 | 7 | 1 | 6 | 19 |
| Chief Medical Officer (Male) | 10 | 8 | 31 | 22 | 71 | 5 | 6 | 16 | 20 | 47 | 50.00% | 75.00% | 51.61% | 90.91% | 66.20% | 5 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 25 |
| Sr. Medical Officer | 163 | 129 | 153 | 11 | 456 | 101 | 90 | 85 | 10 | 286 | 61.96% | 69.77% | 55.56% | 90.91% | 62.72% | 24 | 11 | 14 | 6 | 55 |
| Sr. Women Officer | 73 | 47 | 8 | 3 | 131 | 18 | 19 | 4 | 2 | 43 | 24.66% | 40.43% | 50.00% | 66.67% | 32.82% | 14 | 7 | 5 | 3 | 29 |
| Physician | 36 | 10 | 20 | 9 | 75 | 25 | 6 | 14 | 8 | 53 | 69.44% | 60.00% | 70.00% | 88.89% | 70.67% | 27 | 10 | 14 | 7 | 58 |
| Surgeon | 38 | 11 | 25 | 7 | 81 | 35 | 6 | 20 | 7 | 68 | 92.11% | 54.55% | 80.00% | 100.00% | 83.95% | 25 | 11 | 15 | 7 | 58 |
| Gynecologist | 79 | 10 | 21 | 7 | 117 | 56 | 6 | 18 | 7 | 87 | 70.89% | 60.00% | 85.71% | 100.00% | 74.36% | 27 | 10 | 13 | 6 | 56 |
| Anesthetist | 43 | 12 | 15 | 6 | 76 | 29 | 7 | 7 | 5 | 48 | 67.44% | 58.33% | 46.67% | 83.33% | 63.16% | 25 | 10 | 13 | 6 | 54 |
| Pediatrician | 31 | 10 | 15 | 6 | 62 | 28 | 7 | 13 | 6 | 54 | 90.32% | 70.00% | 86.67% | 100.00% | 87.10% | 26 | 10 | 11 | 6 | 53 |
| Ophthalmologist | 28 | 14 | 14 | 7 | 63 | 24 | 12 | 11 | 6 | 53 | 85.71% | 85.71% | 78.57% | 85.71% | 84.13% | 27 | 10 | 12 | 7 | 56 |
| Dermatologist | 8 | 9 | 7 | 2 | 26 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 13 | 62.50% | 44.44% | 28.57% | 100.00% | 50.00% | 8 | 9 | 6 | 2 | 25 |
| Chest Specialist | 16 | 10 | 6 | 3 | 35 | 13 | 9 | 2 | 2 | 26 | 81.25% | 90.00% | 33.33% | 66.67% | 74.29% | 16 | 9 | 6 | 3 | 34 |
| ENT Specialist | 25 | 9 | 17 | 7 | 58 | 17 | 3 | 11 | 6 | 37 | 68.00% | 33.33% | 64.71% | 85.71% | 63.79% | 25 | 9 | 14 | 7 | 55 |
| Orthopedic Surgeon | 27 | 8 | 16 | 2 | 53 | 21 | 6 | 8 | 1 | 36 | 77.78% | 75.00% | 50.00% | 50.00% | 67.92% | 25 | 8 | 13 | 2 | 48 |
| Radiologist | 31 | 6 | 11 | 0 | 48 | 16 | 2 | 3 | 0 | 21 | 51.61% | 33.33% | 27.27% | | 43.75% | 25 | 6 | 11 | 0 | 42 |
| Cardiologist | 27 | 9 | 13 | 4 | 53 | 21 | 4 | 8 | 3 | 36 | 77.78% | 44.44% | 61.54% | 75.00% | 67.92% | 24 | 9 | 12 | 4 | 49 |
| Urologist | 18 | 7 | 2 | 0 | 27 | 12 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 14 | 66.67% | 14.29% | 50.00% | | 51.85% | 17 | 7 | 2 | 0 | 26 |
| Psychiatrist | 9 | 7 | 6 | 2 | 24 | 6 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 12 | 66.67% | 28.57% | 33.33% | 100.00% | 50.00% | 9 | 7 | 5 | 2 | 23 |

6.2 Appointment of paramedical staff

Information sharing on the sanctioned and appointed positions of paramedical staff was no better. Less than 50% of the monitored DHQs shared information on the positions of nursing superintendents, nursing sisters, ultrasound technicians, hem dialysis technicians and physiotherapy technicians. As for other posts of paramedical staff, information-sharing was comparatively better.

The occupancy rate was better for paramedical staff compared to the medical staff. For these posts in Balochistan, it was at least 70%. No posts for ultrasound technicians, hem dialysis technicians, physiotherapy technicians and radiographers were sanctioned in DHQs monitored in Balochistan.

Similarly in KP, other than the positions of nurse superintendents and physiotherapists, the occupancy rate was at least three-fourths of the sanctioned posts. Thirty three percent posts for nurse superintendents and 44% for physiotherapists were not filled in DHQs in KP.

In Punjab and Sindh, at least 50% posts of paramedical staff were filled.

| Name of post | Sanction strength | | | | | Posted | | | | | Occupancy rate | | | | | Number of DHQs sharing information | | | | |
|------------------------|-------------------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|----------------|--------|--------|-------------|--------|------------------------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
| Nursing Superintendent | 26 | 6 | 9 | 0 | 41 | 15 | 3 | 6 | 0 | 24 | 57.69% | 50.00% | 66.67% | | 58.54% | 16 | 6 | 8 | 0 | 30 |
| Nursing Sister | 151 | 12 | 72 | 4 | 239 | 127 | 9 | 55 | 3 | 194 | 84.11% | 75.00% | 76.39% | 75.00% | 81.17% | 18 | 6 | 5 | 3 | 32 |
| Staff Nurse | 1122 | 182 | 676 | 59 | 2039 | 1103 | 161 | 576 | 42 | 1882 | 98.31% | 88.46% | 85.21% | 71.19% | 92.30% | 25 | 12 | 13 | 9 | 59 |
| Pharmacist | 35 | 6 | 32 | 23 | 96 | 32 | 3 | 25 | 22 | 82 | 91.43% | 50.00% | 78.13% | 95.65% | 85.42% | 24 | 6 | 8 | 10 | 48 |
| Physiotherapist | 21 | 7 | 9 | 3 | 40 | 15 | 2 | 5 | 3 | 25 | 71.43% | 28.57% | 55.56% | 100.00% | 62.50% | 21 | 7 | 8 | 2 | 38 |

| Name of post | Sanction strength | | | | | Posted | | | | | Occupancy rate | | | | | Number of DHQs sharing information | | | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|----------------|---------|---------|-------------|--------|------------------------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
| Lady Health Visitor | 66 | 20 | 17 | 27 | 130 | 65 | 17 | 17 | 26 | 125 | 98.48% | 85.00% | 100.00% | 96.30% | 96.15% | 26 | 12 | 10 | 10 | 58 |
| OT Technician | 54 | 24 | 111 | 12 | 201 | 45 | 23 | 100 | 11 | 179 | 83.33% | 95.83% | 90.09% | 91.67% | 89.05% | 17 | 11 | 14 | 8 | 50 |
| Laboratory Technician | 60 | 20 | 104 | 15 | 199 | 58 | 20 | 97 | 14 | 189 | 96.67% | 100.00% | 93.27% | 93.33% | 94.97% | 26 | 12 | 15 | 7 | 60 |
| Ophthalmic Technician | 54 | 10 | 26 | 2 | 92 | 32 | 9 | 21 | 2 | 64 | 59.26% | 90.00% | 80.77% | 100.00% | 69.57% | 18 | 9 | 13 | 2 | 42 |
| Dental Technician | 47 | 20 | 45 | 15 | 127 | 41 | 19 | 43 | 14 | 117 | 87.23% | 95.00% | 95.56% | 93.33% | 92.13% | 27 | 12 | 15 | 10 | 64 |
| ECG Technician | 65 | 16 | 46 | 6 | 133 | 35 | 15 | 44 | 6 | 100 | 53.85% | 93.75% | 95.65% | 100.00% | 75.19% | 23 | 11 | 15 | 5 | 54 |
| Blood Bank Technician | 21 | 9 | 20 | 1 | 51 | 18 | 6 | 19 | 1 | 44 | 85.71% | 66.67% | 95.00% | 100.00% | 86.27% | 14 | 9 | 12 | 1 | 36 |
| Ultrasound Technician | 1 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 9 | 1 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 100.00% | 71.43% | 0.00% | | 66.67% | 1 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 9 |
| Hem Dialysis Technician | 14 | 5 | 6 | 0 | 25 | 11 | 4 | 5 | 0 | 20 | 78.57% | 80.00% | 83.33% | | 80.00% | 6 | 5 | 4 | 0 | 15 |
| Physiotherapy Technician | 8 | 5 | 21 | 0 | 34 | 4 | 3 | 16 | 0 | 23 | 50.00% | 60.00% | 76.19% | | 67.65% | 9 | 7 | 12 | 0 | 28 |
| Laboratory Assistant | 87 | 17 | 21 | 14 | 139 | 76 | 17 | 19 | 14 | 126 | 87.36% | 100.00% | 90.48% | 100.00% | 90.65% | 27 | 12 | 7 | 9 | 55 |
| Radiographer | 92 | 2 | 66 | 0 | 160 | 87 | 2 | 61 | 0 | 150 | 94.57% | 100.00% | 92.42% | | 93.75% | 27 | 5 | 15 | 0 | 47 |
| X-Ray Technician | 19 | 22 | 11 | 24 | 76 | 11 | 19 | 11 | 22 | 63 | 57.89% | 86.36% | 100.00% | 91.67% | 82.89% | 14 | 11 | 5 | 10 | 40 |
| OT Assistant | 87 | 18 | 15 | 17 | 137 | 75 | 18 | 13 | 16 | 122 | 86.21% | 100.00% | 86.67% | 94.12% | 89.05% | 23 | 9 | 6 | 11 | 49 |
| Midwife | 81 | 37 | 40 | 13 | 171 | 78 | 36 | 40 | 13 | 167 | 96.30% | 97.30% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 97.66% | 26 | 12 | 8 | 7 | 53 |
| Dispenser | 321 | 176 | 289 | 73 | 859 | 315 | 170 | 284 | 72 | 841 | 98.13% | 96.59% | 98.27% | 98.63% | 97.90% | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |

6.3 Appointment of administrative staff

Information sharing on the positions of administrative staff was better than that of the paramedical and medical staff. However, the positions about which less than 50% DHQs shared information were those of civil surgeons (7), Chief Resident Medical Officer (RMO) (11) and additional medical superintendents (33).

All the posts of administrative staff were filled in Balochistan while at least three-fourths for administrative staff were occupied in Sindh and KP. In Punjab, except for the posts of additional medical superintendents (61%), the occupancy rate was more than 80% for the sanctioned paramedical staff posts.

| Name of post | Sanction strength | | | | | Posted | | | | | Occupancy rate | | | | | Number of DHQs sharing information | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|--------|-------|----|-------------|-------|----------------|---------|---------|-------------|--------|------------------------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
| Medical Superintendent | 26 | 7 | 15 | 11 | 59 | 24 | 7 | 15 | 11 | 57 | 92.31% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 96.61% | 26 | 7 | 15 | 11 | 59 |
| Civil Surgeon | 13 | 8 | 6 | 2 | 29 | 13 | 6 | 6 | 2 | 27 | 100.00% | 75.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 93.10% | 11 | 8 | 4 | 2 | 25 |
| Additional Civil Surgeon | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 6 | | 85.71% | | | 85.71% | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 | 7 |
| Additional Medical Superintendent | 31 | 13 | 4 | 2 | 50 | 19 | 10 | 4 | 2 | 35 | 61.29% | 76.92% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 70.00% | 17 | 11 | 3 | 2 | 33 |
| Chief Resident Medical Officer (RMO) | 1 | 10 | 0 | 1 | 12 | 1 | 8 | 0 | 1 | 10 | 100.00% | 80.00% | | 100.00% | 83.33% | 1 | 9 | 0 | 1 | 11 |
| Assistant | 10 | 6 | 14 | 7 | 37 | 8 | 4 | 14 | 7 | 33 | 80.00% | 66.67% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 89.19% | 10 | 6 | 12 | 7 | 35 |
| Clerk | 130 | 58 | 64 | 28 | 280 | 112 | 56 | 57 | 28 | 253 | 86.15% | 96.55% | 89.06% | 100.00% | 90.36% | 27 | 11 | 15 | 11 | 64 |
| Senior Store Keeper | 37 | 15 | 14 | 4 | 70 | 32 | 14 | 12 | 4 | 62 | 86.49% | 93.33% | 85.71% | 100.00% | 88.57% | 24 | 10 | 11 | 4 | 49 |

6.4 Appointment of support staff

At least 58 of the 65 DHQs provided information on the posts of support staff. The occupancy rate appeared to be satisfactory as more than 80% of the sanctioned positions were filled in every region.

| Name of post | Sanction strength | | | | | Posted | | | | | Occupancy rate | | | | | Number of DHQs sharing information | | | | |
|-----------------|-------------------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-----|-------------|-------|----------------|---------|---------|-------------|--------|------------------------------------|-------|----|-------------|-------|
| | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
| Dispenser | 328 | 176 | 289 | 71 | 864 | 321 | 170 | 284 | 70 | 845 | 97.87% | 96.59% | 98.27% | 98.59% | 97.80% | 27 | 12 | 15 | 11 | 65 |
| Peons | 124 | 135 | 142 | 46 | 447 | 120 | 135 | 142 | 46 | 443 | 96.77% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 99.11% | 25 | 9 | 15 | 11 | 60 |
| Watchmen | 133 | 37 | 102 | 33 | 305 | 124 | 31 | 102 | 33 | 290 | 93.23% | 83.78% | 100.00% | 100.00% | 95.08% | 26 | 9 | 14 | 10 | 59 |
| Gardeners | 82 | 21 | 59 | 18 | 180 | 76 | 15 | 57 | 18 | 166 | 92.68% | 71.43% | 96.61% | 100.00% | 92.22% | 27 | 10 | 14 | 8 | 59 |
| Sanitary worker | 732 | 206 | 221 | 21 | 1180 | 657 | 202 | 213 | 21 | 1093 | 89.75% | 98.06% | 96.38% | 100.00% | 92.63% | 27 | 10 | 13 | 8 | 58 |

7. Government oversight

In the three months (November 2011- January 2012), 55 visits were made by government and elected officials to the monitored health facilities. Of these, –the highest of 24 were made by the Executive District Officers (EDOs)/health, followed by government officials (16), MPAs (10) and MNAs (5).

Most of these visits were made to the DHQs in Punjab and the least to those monitored in Balochistan.

| S. # | Designation | Punjab | Sindh | KP | Balochistan | Total |
|--------------|----------------------------------|-----------|----------|-----------|-------------|-----------|
| 1. | MNA | 4 | 1 | - | - | 5 |
| 2. | MPA | 3 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 10 |
| 3. | EDO/Health | 12 | 4 | 6 | 2 | 24 |
| 4. | Any other Government Official | 12 | 1 | 3 | - | 16 |
| 5. | Any other Elected Representative | - | - | - | - | - |
| Total | | 31 | 7 | 13 | 4 | 55 |

Monitoring Methodology

The Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) has launched a nationwide initiative to monitor governance processes under its Supporting Transparency Accountability and Electoral Processes in Pakistan (STAEP) in line with its mandate to strengthen all forms of democratic accountabilities in Pakistan. Objective information about governance processes is vital to encourage informed engagement of citizenry with elected and public institutions for progressive outputs. FAFEN Governance Monitoring aims at enriching the public discourse and debate on governance and developing research-based recommendations for reforms.

FAFEN advocates for transparency, accountability, responsiveness, representativeness and public participation as essential elements of democratic governance to enhance the output, efficiency and effectiveness of all elected and public institutions.

FAFEN Governance Monitors visit schools and colleges, health facilities, police stations and other public institutions to monitor and evaluate their efficiency and efficacy in 200 National Assembly constituencies of 119 districts in Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), Balochistan, Sindh, Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT). In addition, FAFEN is also monitoring complaints handling mechanisms of various public institutions to gauge their effectiveness.

Trained FAFEN Governance Monitors fill out standardized checklists during their monitoring visits, employing interviewing and observation techniques, and then transmit the data to the FAFEN Secretariat in Islamabad for data entry, cleaning and analysis. FAFEN plans to produce monthly thematic reports such as this one. This information will also contribute to FAFEN Bi-Annual State of Governance in Pakistan Reports.

FAFEN Governance Monitoring reports are based on non-probability sampling, and their findings should not be considered national or provincial generalizations. However, FAFEN's outreach across the country allows it to access most districts as well as urban and rural areas. Standardized methodology is applied across Pakistan to draw information in a uniform way through observation and interviewing. The observation and interviews are recorded on a standardized checklist. All information received at the FAFEN Secretariat is verified through multiple sources for authenticity and accuracy. These reports provide data analysis and inferences only for the monitored institutions within the sample. These reports are meant to present to relevant stakeholders a consolidated and current snapshot of the state of governance in public institutions in order to inspire public dialogue and as a contribution towards targeted interventions and reforms.

However, FAFEN's unique methodology to assess and evaluate governance processes continues to evolve. Any inaccuracies that may be noticed in the data or suggestions for improvement in the methodology can be sent to the email address at the end of this report.

Annex: List of Monitored DHQs

| S. # | Name of the Health Facility | District | Province |
|------|---|--------------|----------|
| 1. | District Headquarter Hospital, Muzaffargarh | Muzaffargarh | Punjab |
| 2. | District Headquarter Hospital, Chakwal | Chakwal | Punjab |
| 3. | District Headquarter Hospital, Bhakkar | Bhakkar | Punjab |
| 4. | District Headquarter Hospital, Okara | Okara | Punjab |
| 5. | District Headquarter Hospital, Rajanpur | Rajanpur | Punjab |
| 6. | District Headquarter Hospital, Kasur | Kasur | Punjab |
| 7. | District Headquarter Hospital, Narowal | Narowal | Punjab |
| 8. | District Headquarter Hospital, Jhelum | Jhelum | Punjab |
| 9. | District Headquarter Hospital, Khanewal | Khanewal | Punjab |
| 10. | District Headquarter Hospital, Attock | Attock | Punjab |
| 11. | District Headquarter Hospital, Bahawalnagar | Bahawalnagar | Punjab |
| 12. | District Headquarter Hospital, Vehari | Vehari | Punjab |
| 13. | District Headquarter Hospital, Mianwali | Mianwali | Punjab |

| S. # | Name of the Health Facility | District | Province |
|------|---|---------------------|-------------|
| 14. | District Headquarter Hospital, Pakpattan | Pakpattan | Punjab |
| 15. | Mian Munshi District Headquarter Hospital, Lahore | Lahore | Punjab |
| 16. | District Headquarter Hospital, Dera Ghazi Khan | Dera Ghazi Khan | Punjab |
| 17. | District Headquarter Hospital, Hafizabad | Hafizabad | Punjab |
| 18. | Aziz Bhatti Shaheed District Headquarter Hospital, Gujrat | Gujrat | Punjab |
| 19. | District Headquarter Hospital, Layyah | Layyah | Punjab |
| 20. | Civil Hospital, Multan | Multan | Punjab |
| 21. | District Headquarter Hospital, Gujranwala | Gujranwala | Punjab |
| 22. | Allam Iqbal Memorial Hospital, Sialkot | Sialkot | Punjab |
| 23. | District Headquarter Hospital, Nankana Sahib | Nankana Sahib | Punjab |
| 24. | District Headquarter Hospital, Lodhran | Lodhran | Punjab |
| 25. | District Headquarter Hospital, Sahiwal | Sahiwal | Punjab |
| 26. | District Headquarter Hospital, Toba Tek Singh | Toba Tek Singh | Punjab |
| 27. | District Headquarter Hospital, Jhang | Jhang | Punjab |
| 28. | Civil Hospital, Sanghar | Sanghar | Sindh |
| 29. | District Government Hospital, Paratabad | Hyderabad | Sindh |
| 30. | RBUT Hospital, Shikarpur | Shikarpur | Sindh |
| 31. | Civil Hospital, Mithi | Tharparkar | Sindh |
| 32. | Civil Hospital, Kandhkot | Kashmore | Sindh |
| 33. | Civil Hospital, Mirpurkhas | Mirpurkhas | Sindh |
| 34. | District Headquarter Hospital, Tando Mohammad Khan | Tando Mohammad Khan | Sindh |
| 35. | Civil Hospital Thatta | Thatta | Sindh |
| 36. | District Headquarter Hospital, Mirpur Mathelo | Ghotki | Sindh |
| 37. | District Headquarter Hospital, Tando Allahyar | Tando Allahyar | Sindh |
| 38. | Civil Hospital, Jacobabad | Jacobabad | Sindh |
| 39. | Civil Hospital, Badin | Badin | Sindh |
| 40. | District Headquarter Hospital, Upper Dir | Upper Dir | KP |
| 41. | District Headquarter Hospital, Timergara | Lower Dir | KP |
| 42. | District Headquarter Hospital, Bannu | Bannu | KP |
| 43. | District Headquarter Hospital, Mansehra | Mansehra | KP |
| 44. | District Headquarter Hospital, Dera Ismail Khan | Dera Ismail Khan | KP |
| 45. | District Headquarter Hospital, Kohat | Kohat | KP |
| 46. | District Headquarter Hospital, Battagram | Battagram | KP |
| 47. | District Headquarter Hospital, Haripur | Haripur | KP |
| 48. | District Headquarter Hospital, Swabi | Swabi | KP |
| 49. | District Headquarter Hospital, Tank | Tank | KP |
| 50. | District Headquarter Hospital, Shangla | Shangla | KP |
| 51. | District Headquarter Hospital, Chitral | Chitral | KP |
| 52. | District Headquarter Hospital, Charsadda | Charsadda | KP |
| 53. | District Headquarter Hospital, Karak | Karak | KP |
| 54. | District Headquarter Hospital, Daggar | Buner | KP |
| 55. | District Headquarter Hospital, Kachhi Bolan | Bolan | Balochistan |
| 56. | District Headquarter Hospital, Nasirabad | Nasirabad | Balochistan |
| 57. | District Headquarter Hospital, Ziarat | Ziarat | Balochistan |
| 58. | District Headquarter Hospital, Killa Saifullah | Killa Saifullah | Balochistan |
| 59. | District Headquarter Hospital, Zhob | Zhob | Balochistan |
| 60. | District Headquarter Hospital, Pishin | Pishin | Balochistan |
| 61. | District Headquarter Hospital, Musakhel | Musakhel | Balochistan |
| 62. | District Headquarter Hospital, Loralai | Loralai | Balochistan |
| 63. | Sheikh Fahad Hospital, Dalbandin | Chagai | Balochistan |
| 64. | District Headquarter Hospital, Chaman | Killa Abdullah | Balochistan |
| 65. | District Headquarter Hospital, Nushki | Nushki | Balochistan |

About FAFEN

Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN), established in 2006, is a coalition of 42 leading civil society organizations, working to strengthen all forms of democratic accountabilities in Pakistan. Governed by Trust for Democratic Education and Accountability, FAFEN's key achievements are:

- Observed the public display of Pakistan's draft electoral rolls and conducted the country's first statistically-valid voters' list audit in 2007
- Deployed more than 18,829 trained, neutral Election Day observers nationwide to watch the February 18, 2008 polls and 264 long-term observers to monitor the pre-election process
- Fielded long-term observers nationwide and published 19 pre-election reports
- For the February 18, 2008, General Elections, FAFEN conducted 260 simultaneous Parallel Vote Tabulations (PVTs)- the largest effort in the world
- Conducted its first survey, Constituents Aspirations Survey, in December 2008 with a sample size of 3,124 respondents to get the description of the state of public opinion and also to get a deeper understanding of the values, attitudes and beliefs of people living in the constituencies
- Conducted mapping of organizations working for human rights within Pakistan
- Observed general elections at Gilgit-Baltistan in 2009 and by-elections in various constituencies of the Punjab, Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in 2010
- Implemented a unique methodology to observe parliamentary proceedings under its Parliamentary Watch Project
- Monitors public institutions across Pakistan and issues monthly reports on the state and performance of educational, health and other local level institutions. In addition, monthly reports on prices, crimes, incidence of disease, caseload in lower courts and political and electoral violence are issued.

FAFEN continues to implement robust programs in-between elections related to monitoring parliamentary affairs, connecting constituents to their elected representatives, monitoring the performance of public and elected institutions and advocating electoral and democratic reforms. FAFEN is also monitoring political and electoral violence, peace activities and promoting active citizenry through ongoing civic education activities across the country. FAFEN is currently implementing Supporting Transparency, Accountability and Electoral Processes in Pakistan (STAEP) in 200 National Assembly constituencies in 119 districts across Pakistan.



FAFEN Secretariat

224-Margala Road, F-10/3, Islamabad

(P) 051-22 11 026

(F) 051-22 11 047

(E) secretariat@fafen.org